

Harvard Electricity Policy Group

Olivia Hartridge, Morgan Stanley

Carbon markets: why and how?

1 June 2007

Table of Contents

| | |
|------------------|-------------------------|
| Section 1 | The Morgan Stanley Team |
| Section 2 | The Big Picture |
| Section 3 | Some Lessons Learned |
| Section 4 | Conclusions |

Section 1

The Morgan Stanley Team

The Morgan Stanley Team

Expertise and Investments

- Morgan Stanley has allocated USD 3Bn for investments in the carbon market
- Experienced carbon team with detailed understanding of regulatory issues
- Substantial commodities experience in structuring complex trades

Commodities Trading and Origination

Charles Rankin (Managing Director) charles.rankin@morganstanley.com

John Woodley (Managing Director) john.woodley@morganstanley.com

Carbon Trading

Imtiaz Ahmad

imtiaz.ahmad@morganstanley.com

Olivia Hartridge

olivia.hartridge@morganstanley.com

Dougal Corden

dougal.corden@morganstanley.com

Section 2

The Big Picture

Carbon trading vs carbon tax

- Global problem requires global solution
- Most cost-effective solution is same carbon price worldwide
- Carbon trading allows different emission reduction obligations but the same carbon price
- In contrast, concept of same carbon tax level being implemented worldwide not realistic...
- ...plus the same carbon tax wouldn't necessarily require greater emission reductions from those countries expected to make the first move to address climate change (developed countries)
- Climate change is an environmental problem where a tipping point exists. For that reason, a focus on a quantity limit (carbon trading) as opposed to a price limit (carbon tax) is appropriate

Carbon trading vs carbon tax (continued)

- Frequently asserted that carbon tax is simpler to implement than a carbon trading scheme. Whereas:
 - Monitoring, reporting and verification system requirements identical
 - Seldom the case that the same tax is applied uniformly; normally different tax levels applied/ tax discounts given plus exemptions often granted
 - Difficult to see how this process differs in nature to the allocation process for granting allowances for free
 - Tax levels often subject to a political budgetary process on an annual basis: so no guarantee of long-term price certainty
 - Difficult to see how this degree of certainty definitively differs from the issue of length of allocation period
 - Logic extends to windfall profits issue, offset credits etc. Any policy can remain simple or become complex

The EU emissions trading scheme

- The EU ETS has classic cap and trade design; closely modelled on Acid Rain Program
- So serves as a broad blueprint for other schemes as they develop across the world
- Assessing the scheme on its design and its objectives, it has been a success
- Too much focus on 2005-7 over-allocation
 - Always described as being a short learning-by-doing phase
 - Over-allocation swiftly corrected for the 2008-12 phase
- Why did it happen?
 - Scheme was implemented at a record pace: not enough time to collect third-party verified installation-level data as a basis for setting the 2005-7 cap
- More broadly, many of the lessons learned need to be seen in this context: capable of being resolved through small streamlining changes

Successful design features of the EU ETS

- Source-based system: addresses emissions at the smokestack where best able to be reduced
- Monitoring and reporting standards are high and represent years of improvement and consultation
- Electronic registries system for holding allowances is modern, fast and secure
- Solid and effective compliance regime; ensures that the emissions cap is upheld through time through fixed high penalties and a 1:1 make-good provision
- The 2008-2012 emissions cap will require substantial emission reduction action
- Free-market approach: no market intervention/price controls
- Access to emission reductions generated outside of the EU ETS:
 - Quick link to the international carbon market (project credits)
 - Creates a safety valve which simultaneously encourages investment

Emission reductions to date

- Question often raised is: has the EU ETS delivered emission reductions?
- Answer: yes. Two examples:
 - Immediate response to the carbon price in power markets through dispatch system: benefit from scheme being source-based not load-based
 - Millions of tonnes of emissions reductions generated overseas through the Kyoto Protocol project mechanisms
- Kyoto Protocol registered projects' forecast is 600Mt by 2012 with project pipeline forecast between 1.3 bn to 2.0 bn tonnes by 2012
- Substantial investments made by carbon funds, banks, firms with compliance obligations, commodity traders and governments
- Consulting reports suggest investments of up to USD 7Bn into the carbon market

Section 3

Some Lessons Learned

Data Verification

- Data quality is paramount to a successful ETS
- EU ETS monitoring and reporting standards are high
- But the EU ETS legislation did not provide the same underpinning for verification standards, and equally the accreditation standards for approving verifiers
- Therefore verification and accreditation standards are not harmonised across the EU ETS
- This is work in progress e.g. www.pwc.nl/trustemissions
- **Lesson learned:** treat monitoring, reporting and verification as a coherent whole; so harmonise verification and accreditation across the EU to a high standard

Data release

- Generally 4 principles for releasing market sensitive information or data:
 - the information/data is correct
 - it is summarised, e.g. using headline figures, in a neutral and easily understandable way
 - the date and time for the release is announced at least a few days in advance
 - the whole market can access the data simultaneously (e.g. through a web site)
- Fulfilling these principles gives the market confidence and sends the signal that the ETS is run professionally
- **Lesson learned:** market sensitive data can no longer be released through surprise political statements/speeches; government officials may need training on market abuse/insider trading rules

Allocating emissions allowances

- Emissions cap has to be set below emissions levels and tight enough to enable incentivisation and achievement of targeted reductions
- The carbon market affects prices in other markets, and vice versa
- If the emissions cap is not set far enough ahead, multiple market prices can be influenced by rumours and political signals, which generates additional volatility
- **Lesson learned:** trading periods of 3-5 years are not long enough; set at least the total emissions cap far enough ahead e.g. 10 years
- Planning investments requires substantial forward planning
- Power plant investments require a 15 to 20 year payback period and carbon pricing will be key in assumptions made for debt and equity financing plus commodity hedging of new plants
- **Lesson learned:** this is an additional reason why trading periods of 3-5 years are not long enough; the methodology for distributing the emissions cap amongst companies needs to be stable and predictable through time

Variable market participation

- Even if there is a theoretical financial incentive to participate in an ETS market, experience in both the UK ETS and EU ETS shows that market participants that have allowances to sell don't always enter the market
 - possibly because the company's day-to-day business means that it is not so active in markets in general
 - possibly because current accounting rules do not require the market value of allowances as an asset, and the market value of emissions as a liability, to be shown on the balance sheet
- If these market participants are over-allocated allowances as a form of compensation e.g. because they are more exposed to international competition, the imbalance in the market between active buyers and sellers is further aggravated with price implications
- **Lesson learned:** instead of compensating certain market participants through allowances, it is better to consider auctioning allowances and then providing compensation through Auction Revenue Rights (as per the New England transmission markets). This ensures full participation in the market and the recognition of the value of allowances on the balance sheet, whilst still allowing policy goals to be attained

What's happening outside of the EU?

- Norway will adopt the EU ETS Directive as part of the EEA agreement
- Switzerland is focusing on putting in place a tax first (an exemption from the tax will be possible if take on an emissions cap); otherwise design likely to be similar to EU ETS
- Australia's initial design is promising; similar to EU ETS; may be up and running by 2010; likely to give access to UN project credits, in particular Clean Development Mechanism credits
- California and Northeast US States (Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative) may also be up and running by around 2010
- Northeast US similar in design to EU ETS; but unclear whether system will be over-allocated out to 2015; initial link to international market uncertain since complex process for accessing UN project credits
- California may still adopt a design very different from EU ETS (not source-based but load-based); considering giving access to UN project credits
- Canada further behind in designing system: substantially different from EU ETS e.g. price cap, not cap and trade but intensity-based targets etc.

Section 4

Conclusions

Conclusions

- Carbon tax not a simpler policy instrument, and not appropriate for addressing a global problem
- The EU ETS has been a success and is the major driving force behind the international carbon market
- As a result, investors are actively searching out emission reduction opportunities worldwide
- This market is growing at a rapid pace and presents numerous investment opportunities into the future
- Both the successful design features of the EU ETS, and lessons learned in its development, are highly relevant to other regions developing schemes
- On basis of experience to date, no region faces issues particularly different from other regions: so no need to start re-inventing the wheel and start designing a trading scheme from scratch

Disclaimer

This material was prepared by sales, trading, banking or other non-research personnel of one of the following: Morgan Stanley & Co. Incorporated, Morgan Stanley & Co. International Limited, Morgan Stanley Japan Securities Co., Ltd., Morgan Stanley Capital Group Inc., Morgan Stanley Dean Witter Australia Limited and/or Morgan Stanley Dean Witter Capital Group (Singapore) Pte (together with their affiliates, hereinafter "Morgan Stanley"). Unless otherwise indicated, these views (if any) are the author's and may differ from those of the Morgan Stanley fixed income or equity research department or others in the firm.

This material has been prepared for information purposes only and is not an offer to buy or sell or a solicitation of any offer to buy or sell any security, commodity or instrument or related derivative (hereinafter "instrument") or to participate in any trading strategy. Any such offer would be made only after a prospective participant had completed its own independent investigation of the instrument or trading strategy and received all information it required to make its own investment decision, including, where applicable, a review of any prospectus, prospectus supplement, offering circular, term sheet or memorandum describing such instrument or trading strategy. That information would supersede this material and contain information not contained herein and to which prospective participants are referred. If this material is being distributed in connection with or in advance of the issuance of asset backed securities, information herein regarding any assets backing any such securities supersedes all prior information regarding such assets. We have no obligation to tell you when information herein is stale or may change. We make no representation or warranty with respect to the accuracy or completeness of this material, nor are we obligated to provide updated information on the instruments mentioned herein.

This material may have been prepared by or in conjunction with Morgan Stanley trading desks that may deal as principal in or own or act as market maker or liquidity provider for the instruments mentioned herein. Where you provide us with information relating to an order or proposed transaction ("Information"), we may use that Information to facilitate the execution of your orders or transactions, in managing our market making, other counterparty facilitation activities or otherwise in carrying out our legitimate business (which may include, but is not limited to, hedging a risk or otherwise limiting the risks to which we are exposed). Counterparty facilitation activities may include, without limitation, us taking a principal position in relation to providing counterparties with quotes or as part of the ongoing management of inventories used to facilitate counterparties. Trading desk materials are not independent of the proprietary interests of Morgan Stanley, which may conflict with your interests. Morgan Stanley may also perform or seek to perform investment banking services for the issuers of instruments mentioned herein.

Any securities referred to in this material may not have been registered under the U.S. Securities Act of 1933, as amended, and, if not, may not be offered or sold absent an exemption therefrom. In relation to any member state of the European Economic Area, a prospectus may not have been published pursuant to measures implementing the Prospectus Directive (2003/71/EC) and any securities referred to herein may not be offered in circumstances that would require such publication. Recipients are required to comply with any legal or contractual restrictions on their purchase, holding, sale, exercise of rights or performance of obligations under any instrument or otherwise applicable to any transaction.

The securities, commodities or other instruments (or related derivatives) discussed in this material may not be suitable for all investors. This material has been prepared and issued by Morgan Stanley for distribution to market professionals and institutional investor clients only. Other recipients should seek independent investment advice prior to making any investment decision based on this material. This material does not provide individually tailored investment advice or offer tax, regulatory, accounting or legal advice. Prior to entering into any proposed transaction, recipients should determine, in consultation with their own investment, legal, tax, regulatory and accounting advisors, the economic risks and merits, as well as the legal, tax, regulatory and accounting characteristics and consequences, of the transaction. You should consider this material as only a single factor in making an investment decision.

Options are not for everyone. Before purchasing or writing options, investors should understand the nature and extent of their rights and obligations and be aware of the risks involved, including the risks pertaining to the business and financial condition of the issuer and the underlying instrument. A secondary market may not exist for certain of these instruments. For Morgan Stanley customers who are purchasing or writing exchange-traded options, please review the publication "Characteristics and Risks of Standardized Options," which is available from your account representative.

The value of and income from investments may vary because of changes in interest rates, foreign exchange rates, default rates, prepayment rates, securities, prices of instruments, market indexes, operational or financial conditions of companies or other factors. There may be time limitations on the exercise of options or other rights in instruments (or related derivatives) transactions. Past performance is not necessarily a guide to future performance. Estimates of future performance are based on assumptions that may not be realized. Actual events may differ from those assumed and changes to any assumptions may have a material impact on any projections or estimates. Other events not taken into account may occur and may significantly affect the projections or estimates. Certain assumptions may have been made for modeling purposes only to simplify the presentation and/or calculation of any projections or estimates, and Morgan Stanley does not represent that any such assumptions will reflect actual future events. Accordingly, there can be no assurance that estimated returns or projections will be realized or that actual returns or performance results will not materially differ from those estimated herein. Some of the information contained in this document may be aggregated data of transactions executed by Morgan Stanley that has been compiled so as not to identify the underlying transactions of any particular customer.

Notwithstanding anything herein to the contrary, Morgan Stanley and each recipient hereof agree that they (and their employees, representatives, and other agents) may disclose to any and all persons, without limitation of any kind from the commencement of discussions, the U.S. federal and state income tax treatment and tax structure of the transaction and all materials of any kind (including opinions or other tax analyses) that are provided to it relating to the tax treatment and tax structure. For this purpose, "tax structure" is limited to facts relevant to the U.S. federal and state income tax treatment of the transaction and does not include information relating to the identity of the parties, their affiliates, agents or advisors.

In Europe, this material is directed to those persons who are market counterparties or intermediate customers (as defined in the UK Financial Services Authority's rules). In or from the DIFC, this information is communicated by Morgan Stanley & Co. International Limited (DIFC Branch), regulated by the Dubai Financial Services Authority (the DFSA), and is directed at wholesale customers only, as defined by the DFSA. In Japan, this material is directed to the qualified institutional investors as defined under the Securities Exchange Law of Japan and its ordinances thereunder. In Singapore, this material is directed to Accredited Investors as defined under the Commodities Trading Act of Singapore and its schedule thereunder. In Australia, this material is disseminated by Morgan Stanley Dean Witter Australia Limited ABN 67 003 734 576. For additional information, research reports and important disclosures see <https://secure.ms.com/servlet/cis>. The trademarks and service marks contained herein are the property of their respective owners. Third-party data providers make no warranties or representations of any kind relating to the accuracy, completeness, or timeliness of the data they provide and shall not have liability for any damages of any kind relating to such data.

Please note that market data may be proprietary and confidential to the relevant exchange, index owner or information provider and may reserve all intellectual property rights in such data. Such data should also not be disseminated without their consent, and such permission may depend upon execution of an agreement or payment of an applicable fee. No representation or warranty, express or implied, can be given with respect to the accuracy, completeness, correctness, sufficiency or usefulness of the information. Morgan Stanley and the relevant exchange, index owner or information provider disclaims any and all liability for any loss howsoever arising from, related to or in connection with any use of any of the information or other materials contained herein, including without limitation any express or implied representations or warranties for, statements contained in, omissions from, the information contained herein. Morgan Stanley or the relevant exchange, index owner or information provider may suspend or terminate receipt or display of any data it believes it is being misused or misrepresented.

This material may not be distributed in any jurisdiction where it is unlawful to do so. This material may not be sold or redistributed without the prior written consent of Morgan Stanley. This material is not a product of Morgan Stanley's Research Department and should not be regarded as a research report.